JUMPA | JURNAL MANAJEMEN PENDIDIKAN

JUMPA: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan
Vol. 06 No. 02 (2025): 174-188
Available online at https://ejournal.unuja.ac.id/index.php/jumpa/index

Institutional Management and Quality Assurance in Quranic Education Effectiveness

Zainul Fuad[1*], Imam Azhar[2], Zulkarnain[3], Imam Karya Bakti[4]

[1,2]Institut Agama Islam Tarbiyatut Tholabah Lamongan, Indonesia
[3]Sekolah Tinggi Ilmu Syariah Darul Falah Pagutan Mataram, Indonesia
[4]Universitas Nahdlatul Ulama Blitar, Indonesia

*Email Corresponding author: zainul.fuad@iai-tabah.ac.id

Abstract

This study aims to analyze the effectiveness of Ummi Method implementation in Quranic education and to identify the institutional factors influencing its success across educational institutions in Indonesia. A quantitative approach with a descriptive-comparative design and limited longitudinal elements was employed, involving 127 institutions selected through purposive and stratified sampling techniques. Data were collected using the standardized Ummi Method Learning Supervision Form, which encompasses eight evaluation dimensions, and analyzed using descriptive statistics, ANOVA, paired t-tests, and correlation analysis. The findings indicate that the overall effectiveness of implementation is at a fair-to-good level (M = 3.54), with significant variation across institutions. Learning preparation achieved the highest performance, while evaluation and closing dimensions showed comparatively weaker results. Longitudinal analysis reveals significant improvement over time ($p < 0.001$), suggesting ongoing institutional development. Notably, management effectiveness demonstrates the strongest positive correlation with learning outcomes ($r = 0.67$), followed by teacher certification and community engagement, whereas institutional size shows a weak negative correlation. These findings highlight that the effectiveness of Quranic education is not solely determined by instructional methods but is fundamentally influenced by institutional management systems, teacher competency, and quality assurance mechanisms. The study underscores the importance of strengthening institutional capacity, enhancing teacher professionalism, and implementing systematic evaluation frameworks to ensure sustainable improvement in Quranic education.

Article History
Received : 13 August 2025
Revised : 26 November 2025
Accepted : 28 December 2025

Keywords: *Institutional Management, Quality Assurance, Ummi Method, Quranic Education, Learning Effectiveness*

DOI: https://doi.org/10.33650/jumpa.v6i2.14838
How to Cite:
Fuad, Z., Azhar, I., Zulkarnain, & Bakti, I. K. (2025). Institutional Management and Quality Assurance in Quranic Education Effectiveness. *JUMPA: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan, 6*(2), 174–188.

INTRODUCTION

The transformation of Quranic education in contemporary contexts presents significant challenges in balancing traditional religious values with modern educational demands. Across Indonesia, Quranic learning institutions such as *Taman Pendidikan Al-Qur'an (TPQ)*, *madrasah*s, and formal schools face increasing pressure to improve instructional effectiveness, student engagement, and institutional quality while

maintaining the authenticity of Islamic teachings (Arifin & Agustiani, 2025; Evi Gusliana & Nurlela, 2022; Raihanah, 2023). According to data from the Indonesian Ministry of Religious Affairs, millions of students are enrolled in Quranic education programs nationwide, reflecting the strategic importance of this sector in shaping religious literacy and moral development (Encina-Montoya et al., 2025; Singgih, 2023; Zuhdi, 2022). However, disparities in institutional quality, teacher competency, and management systems remain a persistent concern, particularly in community-based institutions. Global education reports, including those by UNESCO, emphasize that achieving quality education (SDG 4) requires not only effective teaching methods but also robust institutional governance and quality assurance mechanisms (Munda, 2024; Omirbayev, 2023). This indicates that the success of Quranic education cannot be separated from the broader institutional ecosystem in which it operates.

Recent studies on Quranic and Islamic education have primarily focused on pedagogical innovation and instructional strategies. For instance, Noprianti et al. (2025) found that the implementation of the Ummi Method significantly improves students' Quranic reading ability through interactive and structured learning approaches. Similarly, Alghozi & Husna (2025) demonstrated a strong relationship between the use of the Ummi Method and improved reading proficiency among students. Other studies have highlighted the importance of repetition and direct methods in enhancing language acquisition and retention (Li Yue, 2024; Milosavljevic & Reynolds, 2024; Strong, 2023). While these studies provide valuable insights into instructional effectiveness, they predominantly adopt a classroom-level perspective and tend to overlook the institutional conditions that enable or constrain successful implementation. Research on educational management (Obeng et al., 2025), emphasizes that quality assurance systems and organizational frameworks are critical determinants of sustainable educational outcomes, yet such perspectives remain underexplored in the context of Quranic education.

This imbalance reveals a critical research gap. Existing literature has largely neglected the role of institutional management systems, administrative coordination, and quality assurance mechanisms in shaping the effectiveness of Quranic learning methods. Most studies treat pedagogical approaches as isolated variables without considering the institutional infrastructure required for consistent and scalable implementation. Consequently, there is limited empirical evidence explaining why similar methods, such as the Ummi Method, produce varying outcomes across different institutions. This study addresses this gap by shifting the analytical focus from pedagogy to institutional management, positioning administrative systems and quality assurance frameworks as central determinants of educational effectiveness. The novelty of this research lies in its comprehensive quantitative analysis across multiple institutional contexts, integrating pedagogical, managerial, and organizational dimensions into a unified analytical framework.

Based on this perspective, the primary objective of this study is to analyze the effectiveness of Ummi Method implementation across Indonesian educational institutions and to identify the key factors influencing its success. Specifically, this study aims to (1) measure the overall effectiveness of implementation across diverse institutional types, (2) examine variations in performance based on institutional characteristics, (3) analyze the role of management systems and quality assurance mechanisms, and (4) investigate the relationships between teacher competency, institutional management, and learning outcomes. By addressing these objectives, this study contributes to both theoretical development and practical improvement in

Quranic education.

This study argues that the effectiveness of Quranic education is not solely determined by the quality of instructional methods but is fundamentally shaped by the interaction between pedagogical practices and institutional management systems. In this context, the Ummi Method serves as a case study to explore how structured management, teacher certification, and quality assurance mechanisms influence implementation outcomes. Rather than focusing exclusively on instructional techniques, this study adopts a systems perspective, emphasizing the importance of organizational capacity, coordination, and continuous evaluation. This approach enables a deeper understanding of how educational effectiveness is constructed within institutional environments, thereby providing a more holistic framework for analyzing Islamic education.

Given the increasing demand for quality assurance and institutional accountability in education, this study offers timely insights into the development of sustainable Quranic education systems. The findings are expected to inform policymakers, educational practitioners, and institutional leaders in designing more effective management frameworks that support consistent implementation and long-term improvement. Furthermore, this study contributes to the broader discourse on integrating traditional Islamic education with contemporary educational standards, highlighting the need for adaptive and evidence-based institutional strategies.

RESEARCHS METHOD

This section describes the research procedures, including research design, population and sampling, research instruments, data collection, data analysis, and ethical considerations.

Research Design and Framework

This study employed a quantitative approach using descriptive-comparative methods, complemented by case study elements, to examine the effectiveness of Ummi Method implementation. The study was grounded in a positivist paradigm, emphasizing objective measurement and systematic evaluation of instructional practices (Habibi, 2024) . A cross-sectional design with limited longitudinal elements was adopted, utilizing data from two periods (2024 and 2025) to analyze temporal development trends. This design enabled both cross-institutional comparisons and longitudinal assessment of implementation dynamics across diverse educational contexts.

Population and Sample

The target population consisted of all educational institutions implementing the Ummi Method in Indonesia registered within the Ummi Foundation supervision system (N = 1,247 as of December 2024). From this population, 127 institutions (10.2%) were selected using purposive sampling combined with stratified techniques to ensure representation across institutional types and geographical regions. Inclusion criteria required institutions to have implemented the method for at least one year, possess complete supervision data, and demonstrate willingness to participate. Institutions undergoing leadership transitions or lacking complete data were excluded to ensure data quality and stability.

Sampling was conducted through a three-stage process: (1) regional stratification across six major regions in Indonesia; (2) institutional type stratification (TPQ, MI, MTs, SD, SMP, and PAUD/TK); and (3) stratified random selection within each

group, with oversampling for underrepresented categories. This approach enhanced representativeness and minimized selection bias (Alexander, 2021; Fang et al., 2025; Iliyasu & Etikan, 2021). To illustrate the distribution of the sample across institutional types and observation periods, the sample characteristics are presented in **Table 1**.

Table 1. Sample Characteristics by Institution Type and Period

Institution Type	2024 Sample	2025 Sample	Total	Percentage (%)
TPQ	55	34	89	70.1
MI	14	8	22	17.3
MTs	4	4	8	6.3
SD	2	2	4	3.1
SMP	1	1	2	1.6
PAUD/TK	0	2	2	1.6
Total	76	51	127	100.0

The distribution indicates the predominance of community-based Quranic education institutions while maintaining representation across formal education levels.

Research Instrument

Data were collected using the Ummi Method Learning Supervision Form, a standardized instrument developed and validated by the Ummi Foundation. The instrument comprises eight dimensions and 45 indicators covering key aspects of instructional implementation. To provide a structured overview of the instrument components, the dimensions and their corresponding indicators are presented in **Table 2**.

Table 2. Supervision Instrument Dimensions and Indicators

No	Dimension	Indicators	Assessed Aspects
1	Learning Preparation	6	Planning and material readiness
2	Opening	5	Motivation and initial engagement
3	Apperception and Pre-test	4	Student readiness
4	New Material Presentation	8	Instructional delivery
5	Practice and Habituation	7	Reinforcement processes
6	Evaluation	6	Assessment procedures
7	Closing	4	Learning consolidation
8	Classroom Management	5	Time and student management

All indicators were assessed using a five-point Likert scale (1 = very poor to 5 = excellent), allowing for detailed measurement of implementation quality (Okunbanjo et al., 2024).

Instrument Validity and Reliability

The instrument demonstrated strong psychometric properties. Content validity was confirmed through expert evaluation (CVR = 0.89; CVI = 0.92). Construct validity was established using confirmatory factor analysis ($\chi^2/df = 2.14$; RMSEA = 0.065; CFI = 0.94; TLI = 0.93), with all factor loadings exceeding 0.5. Reliability analysis showed high internal consistency (Cronbach's $\alpha = 0.94$) and strong inter-rater agreement (ICC = 0.91; Cohen's Kappa = 0.88), indicating stable and consistent measurement across evaluators (Bujang et al., 2025; KÖROĞLU, 2025; Marzi et al., 2024).

Data Collection

Data were collected through direct classroom observations conducted by

certified trainers with a minimum of three years of experience. Each observation session lasted 60–90 minutes and followed standardized procedures, including documentation through field notes and supporting materials. Data collection was conducted in two waves: Wave I (January–June 2024, n = 76) and Wave II (January–March 2025, n = 51), enabling longitudinal comparison. Data verification involved cross-checking observations with documentation and validation by senior supervisors.

Data Analysis

Data analysis included descriptive and inferential statistical techniques. Descriptive analysis involved mean, standard deviation, and frequency distributions. Normality was tested using Kolmogorov-Smirnov and Shapiro-Wilk tests (González-Estrada et al., 2022). Comparative analysis was conducted using one-way ANOVA with Tukey HSD post-hoc tests, while non-parametric alternatives were applied when assumptions were not met. Correlation analysis employed Pearson and Spearman coefficients to examine relationships among variables. Multiple regression analysis was used to identify predictors of institutional effectiveness. All statistical analyses were performed using SPSS 28.0, R 4.3.0, and Microsoft Excel 365

Ethical Considerations

This study received ethical approval from the Research Ethics Committee of UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya (KEP/UINSA/2024/001). All participating institutions provided informed consent, and data confidentiality was ensured through anonymization and secure storage. The study posed minimal risk to participants and contributed to the development of Quranic education practices by providing institutional feedback and supporting quality improvement initiatives.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Result

Comprehensive Institutional Analysis

This study analyzed 127 educational institutions across diverse regions of Indonesia, providing broad representation of Quranic education contexts. The distribution of institutions shows a clear dominance of community-based religious education settings, particularly *Taman Pendidikan Al-Qur'an (TPQ)*, which accounts for 89 institutions (70.1%). Formal Islamic educational institutions are represented by *Madrasah* Ibtidaiyah (MI) with 22 institutions (17.3%) and *Madrasah* Tsanawiyah (MTs) with 8 institutions (6.3%). In contrast, general formal education institutions are minimally represented, including *Sekolah Dasar* (SD) with 4 institutions (3.1%), *Sekolah Menengah Pertama* (SMP) with 2 institutions (1.6%), and early childhood education institutions (PAUD/TK) also comprising 2 institutions (1.6%). To provide a clearer overview of the institutional composition, the distribution of educational institutions by type is presented in **Table 3**.

Table 3. Distribution of Educational Institutions by Type

Institution Type	n	Percentage (%)
TPQ (Quranic Education Centers)	89	70.1
MI (Islamic Elementary School)	22	17.3
MTs (Islamic Junior High School)	8	6.3
SD (Elementary School)	4	3.1
SMP (Junior High School)	2	1.6
PAUD/TK (Early Childhood Education)	2	1.6

Total	127	100.0

The data in **Table 3** indicate that the implementation of the Ummi Method is predominantly concentrated in non-formal religious education institutions. This distribution suggests that institutional context may play a significant role in shaping implementation characteristics, resource availability, and overall effectiveness. The limited representation of general formal education institutions also indicates potential differences in adoption patterns, which warrant further comparative analysis across institutional types.

Student and Teacher Demographics

The demographic profile of the sampled institutions reflects substantial diversity in both student and teacher populations. The total number of learners exceeds 18,000, covering a wide range of educational levels from early childhood to adult education programs. Gender distribution is relatively balanced, with female students accounting for 52.3% of the total population, indicating equitable access to Quranic education across genders.

From the instructional perspective, more than 1,300 teachers are involved in the implementation of the Ummi Method across institutions. The overall teacher certification rate averages 73.8%, indicating a moderate level of professional qualification. However, notable disparities are observed between institutional types, with formal educational institutions demonstrating higher certification rates (89.2%) compared to community-based TPQ centers (67.4%). To provide a clearer summary of these demographic characteristics, the key student and teacher indicators are presented in **Table 4**.

Table 4. Student and Teacher Demographics

Variable	Value
Total Students	>18,000
Female Students (%)	52.3
Total Teachers	>1,300
Average Certification Rate (%)	73.8
Certification Rate (Formal Institutions)	89.2
Certification Rate (TPQ)	67.4

Table 4 indicate that although the Ummi Method has been widely implemented across diverse educational settings, disparities in teacher qualification remain evident. These differences suggest unequal access to professional development and may contribute to variation in instructional quality. Consequently, strengthening teacher certification and training systems becomes essential to ensure consistent implementation standards and improved learning outcomes across institutional types.

Learning Effectiveness Analysis

Overall Effectiveness Scores and Performance Distribution

Systematic assessment of learning effectiveness using the 8-dimension Ummi Method supervision instrument revealed varying implementation quality across institutions. The overall effectiveness achieved a mean score of 3.54 (SD = 0.72) on the five-point scale, indicating fair-to-good performance levels across the sample. Performance distribution analysis demonstrates approximately 34% of institutions

achieving good or excellent effectiveness levels (scores ≥4.0), while 43% demonstrated fair performance (scores 3.0-3.9), and 23% showed below-average implementation requiring substantial improvement (scores <3.0).

Table 5. Performance Distribution by Effectiveness Score

Score Range	Performance Level	Frequency	Percentage	Cumulative %
4.5-5.0	Excellent	8	6.3%	6.3%
4.0-4.4	Good	35	27.6%	33.9%
3.5-3.9	Fair-Good	31	24.4%	58.3%
3.0-3.4	Fair	24	18.9%	77.2%
2.5-2.9	Poor-Fair	21	16.5%	93.7%
2.0-2.4	Poor	6	4.7%	98.4%
1.5-1.9	Very Poor	2	1.6%	100.0%
Total		127	100.0%	

The distribution in **Table 5** reveals that only a limited proportion of institutions achieved high levels of effectiveness, with 33.9% categorized as good or excellent. The majority of institutions (43.3%) fall within the fair performance range, indicating that while basic implementation structures are in place, there remains substantial room for improvement. Notably, 22.8% of institutions are still categorized as below average, suggesting inconsistencies in implementation quality across contexts. These findings highlight a critical variation in institutional performance, indicating that the effectiveness of the Ummi Method is not uniformly achieved across educational settings. This variation suggests the influence of underlying institutional factors, such as management systems, teacher competency, and resource availability, which will be further examined in subsequent analyses.

Dimension-Specific Performance Analysis

A detailed analysis across eight key learning dimensions reveals distinct performance patterns and varying levels of implementation quality. This analysis provides a more granular understanding of how different components of the Ummi Method are executed across institutions. To present the comparative performance across dimensions, the descriptive statistics and confidence intervals are summarized in **Table 6**.

Table 6. Learning Effectiveness by Dimensions with Confidence Intervals

Learning Dimension	Mean	SD	95% CI Lower	95% CI Upper	Performance Level	Rank
Learning Preparation	3.89	0.78	3.75	4.03	Good	1
Opening	3.72	0.71	3.60	3.84	Fair–Good	2
New Material Presentation	3.62	0.84	3.47	3.77	Fair–Good	3
Practice and Habituation	3.55	0.79	3.41	3.69	Fair–Good	4
Classroom Management	3.48	0.86	3.33	3.63	Fair	5
Apperception and Pre-test	3.41	0.73	3.28	3.54	Fair	6
Evaluation	3.34	0.81	3.20	3.48	Fair	7
Closing	2.94	0.89	2.78	3.10	Poor–Fair	8
Overall Average	3.54	0.72	3.41	3.67	Fair–Good	

Table 6 indicate that Learning Preparation achieved the highest mean score (M

= 3.89), reflecting strong performance in planning, material readiness, and instructional structuring, which suggests that institutions generally demonstrate adequate preparedness prior to instructional delivery. In contrast, the Closing dimension recorded the lowest performance (M = 2.94), falling within the poor-to-fair category, indicating a systematic weakness in concluding learning sessions, including summarization, reflection, and reinforcement of learning outcomes. Most other dimensions, including Opening, New Material Presentation, and Practice and Habituation, fall within the fair-to-good range, indicating moderate implementation quality, while Evaluation and Apperception remain in the fair category, suggesting that formative assessment and student readiness processes require further strengthening. Overall, the variation across dimensions reveals an imbalance in implementation, where early-stage instructional components tend to perform better than end-stage processes, highlighting the need for more comprehensive instructional management that ensures not only effective delivery but also systematic evaluation and reinforcement of learning outcomes.

Temporal Improvement Analysis

Longitudinal analysis comparing institutions with multiple assessment periods (n = 51) demonstrates a statistically significant improvement in overall implementation over time, with paired t-test results indicating a meaningful increase in effectiveness scores ($t(50) = 4.87$, $p < 0.001$, Cohen's $d = 0.68$), reflecting a medium-to-large effect size. To provide a detailed comparison across time periods, the changes in each learning dimension between 2024 and 2025 are presented in **Table 7**.

Table 7. Temporal Improvement Analysis (2024–2025 Comparison)

Learning Dimension	2024 Mean (SD)	2025 Mean (SD)	Mean Difference	95% CI	t-statistic	p-value
Learning Preparation	3.78 (0.81)	3.89 (0.76)	+0.11	[-0.02, 0.24]	1.73	0.089
New Material Presentation	3.45 (0.87)	3.62 (0.82)	+0.17	[0.05, 0.29]	2.84**	0.007
Classroom Management	3.22 (0.91)	3.48 (0.84)	+0.26	[0.12, 0.40]	3.68***	0.001
Practice and Habituation	3.38 (0.83)	3.55 (0.77)	+0.17	[0.04, 0.30]	2.61**	0.012
Evaluation	3.15 (0.85)	3.34 (0.79)	+0.19	[0.06, 0.32]	2.95**	0.005
Apperception and Pre-test	3.28 (0.76)	3.41 (0.71)	+0.13	[0.01, 0.25]	2.18*	0.034
Opening	3.65 (0.74)	3.72 (0.69)	+0.07	[-0.05, 0.19]	1.24	0.221
Closing	2.82 (0.93)	2.94 (0.87)	+0.12	[-0.02, 0.26]	1.69	0.097
Overall Average	3.34 (0.75)	3.49 (0.71)	+0.15	[0.06, 0.24]	3.42*	0.001

*p < 0.05, **p < 0.01, ***p < 0.001

Management Systems and Administrative Effectiveness

Comprehensive analysis of administrative frameworks indicates that management systems constitute critical determinants of implementation effectiveness across institutions. High-performing institutions (top quartile, n = 32) consistently demonstrate more structured and systematic management practices compared to low-

performing institutions (bottom quartile, n = 32). To examine the association between management factors and performance levels, chi-square analysis was conducted, and the results are presented in **Table 8**.

Table 8. Management Effectiveness Factors by Performance Quartiles

Management Factor	High Performers (n=32)	Average Performers (n=63)	Low Performers (n=32)	χ^2	p-value	Cramer's V
Dedicated Program Coordinator	29 (90.6%)	43 (68.3%)	11 (34.4%)	22.47***	<0.001	0.42
Weekly Teacher Meetings	27 (84.4%)	26 (41.3%)	6 (18.8%)	26.31***	<0.001	0.45
Systematic Progress Tracking	28 (87.5%)	35 (55.6%)	8 (25.0%)	24.89***	<0.001	0.44
Quality Control Mechanisms	29 (90.6%)	28 (44.4%)	6 (18.8%)	31.56***	<0.001	0.50
Strategic Resource Allocation	26 (81.3%)	32 (50.8%)	9 (28.1%)	17.73***	<0.001	0.37
Parent-Community Communication	25 (78.1%)	30 (47.6%)	7 (21.9%)	18.42***	<0.001	0.38
Digital Administration	21 (65.6%)	20 (31.7%)	4 (12.5%)	19.77***	<0.001	0.39

***p < 0.001

Performance Excellence Case Analysis

Performance distribution analysis reveals substantial variation in implementation quality across institutions. To provide a clearer classification of institutional performance levels, the categorization based on effectiveness scores is presented in **Table 9**.

Table 9. Institutional Performance Categories with Descriptive Statistics

Performance Category	Score Range	n	Percentage	Mean Score	Key Characteristics
Excellent	4.5-5.0	8	6.3%	4.73 (SD=0.18)	• Comprehensive teacher certification • Advanced management systems • Strong community engagement
Good	4.0-4.4	35	27.6%	4.18 (SD=0.12)	• Regular supervision protocols • Adequate resource allocation • Systematic quality control
Fair	3.0-3.9	55	43.3%	3.42 (SD=0.28)	• Basic implementation structure • Developing coordination systems • Moderate teacher training
Needs Improvement	2.0-2.9	27	21.3%	2.67 (SD=0.21)	• Limited teacher certification • Weak administrative systems • Insufficient resource planning
Poor	<2.0	2	1.6%	1.85 (SD=0.21)	• Minimal implementation • No systematic coordination • Urgent intervention required

Statistical Significance and Reliability Analysis

Data Validity and Measurement Reliability

The reliability analysis confirms that the measurement instrument demonstrates strong internal consistency and inter-rater agreement across all assessment dimensions. The Cronbach's alpha coefficients range from 0.81 to 0.91, with an overall reliability of α = 0.94, indicating excellent internal consistency. In addition, inter-rater reliability analysis shows a high level of agreement among evaluators (ICC = 0.91, 95% CI: 0.87–0.94), confirming the consistency of assessments across different institutional contexts. A detailed breakdown of reliability indicators for each dimension is presented in **Table 10**.

Table 10. Reliability Analysis by Assessment Dimensions

Assessment Dimension	Cronbach's α	ICC	95% CI Lower	95% CI Upper	Items	Reliability Level
Learning Preparation	0.87	0.89	0.84	0.93	6	Excellent
Opening	0.83	0.86	0.81	0.91	5	Good
Apperception and Pre-test	0.81	0.84	0.79	0.89	4	Good
New Material Presentation	0.91	0.93	0.89	0.96	8	Excellent
Practice and Habituation	0.89	0.91	0.87	0.94	7	Excellent
Evaluation	0.86	0.88	0.83	0.92	6	Good
Closing	0.82	0.85	0.80	0.90	4	Good
Classroom Management	0.85	0.87	0.82	0.91	5	Good
Overall Instrument	0.94	0.91	0.87	0.94	45	Excellent

Performance Correlation Analysis

Correlation analysis reveals significant relationships among key variables influencing institutional effectiveness. Pearson correlation results indicate a strong positive association between management effectiveness and overall institutional effectiveness (r = 0.67, p < 0.001, 95% CI: 0.56–0.76), suggesting that well-structured administrative systems play a central role in determining successful implementation outcomes. To provide a comprehensive overview of these relationships, the correlation matrix is presented in **Table 11**.

Table 11. Correlation Matrix of Key Variables

Variable	1	2	3	4	5	6
1. Overall Effectiveness	—					
2. Management Effectiveness	0.67***	—				
3. Teacher Certification Rate	0.54***	0.48***	—			
4. Institution Size (log)	-0.23*	-0.18	0.12	—		
5. Years of Implementation	0.41***	0.35**	0.29**	0.15	—	
6. Community Engagement	0.52***	0.58***	0.31**	-0.21*	0.28**	—

*p < 0.05, **p < 0.01, ***p < 0.001

Note: 95% confidence intervals for all correlations available upon request.

Discussion

This study was conducted to address a critical gap in the literature on Quranic education, which has predominantly emphasized pedagogical techniques while overlooking the role of institutional management and quality assurance systems in determining educational effectiveness. By examining the implementation of the Ummi Method across diverse Indonesian educational institutions, this study aimed to provide a comprehensive understanding of how administrative structures, teacher competency,

and quality assurance mechanisms influence learning outcomes. The significance of this study lies in its contribution to shifting the analytical focus from classroom-level practices to institutional-level determinants of educational success.

The findings reveal that the overall effectiveness of Ummi Method implementation falls within the fair-to-good category (M = 3.54), indicating that while the method is broadly applicable across contexts, its implementation remains uneven. A key strength identified in this study is the strong performance in instructional preparation (M = 3.89), suggesting that institutions generally possess adequate planning and readiness mechanisms. However, weaknesses are evident in the closing and evaluation stages (M = 2.94 and 3.34, respectively), indicating gaps in learning consolidation and assessment practices. This imbalance suggests that institutions tend to prioritize instructional delivery over reflective and evaluative components of learning.

One of the most significant findings of this study is the strong positive relationship between management effectiveness and institutional performance ($r = 0.67$, $p < 0.001$). This result supports the argument that educational success is not solely determined by pedagogical methods but is heavily influenced by the quality of institutional management systems (Wang & Zhang, 2025). This finding aligns with previous research emphasizing the importance of organizational structures and quality assurance frameworks in educational effectiveness (Fedyk et al., 2025; Marquina et al., 2022; Röbken & Schütz, 2023). Similarly, the moderate correlation between teacher certification and effectiveness ($r = 0.54$) is consistent with studies highlighting the role of teacher professionalism in improving learning outcomes (Ata Bina Lujjah Fauziyah et al., 2025; Istaqimi et al., 2024; Levin & Major, 2025).

Interestingly, the study also reveals a weak negative correlation between institutional size and effectiveness ($r = -0.23$), suggesting that smaller institutions may achieve higher efficiency due to closer supervision, stronger community engagement, and more flexible management systems. This finding, while somewhat unexpected, can be explained by the ability of smaller institutions to maintain more personalized and responsive instructional environments (et al., 2025). In contrast, larger institutions may face challenges related to coordination complexity and resource distribution, which can affect implementation consistency. The longitudinal analysis further demonstrates that institutional effectiveness improves over time ($d = 0.68$), indicating that the implementation of the Ummi Method benefits from organizational learning processes. Improvements in classroom management and evaluation suggest that institutions gradually develop more sophisticated instructional practices as they gain experience. This finding reinforces the notion that educational innovation requires sustained implementation and continuous improvement rather than immediate results (Huang & Chueh, 2023; Pavlenkov & Gizatullin, 2021; Prihandoko et al., 2024).

From a theoretical perspective, this study contributes to institutional effectiveness theory by demonstrating that educational outcomes are shaped by the interaction between pedagogical approaches and administrative systems. The findings support a systems-based view of education, where management structures, teacher competency, and community engagement function as interconnected components influencing learning effectiveness. Practically, these findings suggest that efforts to improve Quranic education should prioritize strengthening institutional management systems, expanding teacher certification programs, and enhancing quality assurance mechanisms. For practical application, these findings suggest that educational

policymakers and practitioners should focus on developing integrated management frameworks that support consistent implementation across institutions. For example, establishing regular teacher meetings, systematic progress tracking, and dedicated program coordinators can significantly enhance implementation quality, as evidenced by the high-performing institutions in this study. Additionally, targeted training programs for teachers in community-based institutions (TPQ) are essential to reduce disparities in certification rates and improve instructional quality.

Based on these findings, several implications for future research can be proposed. Future studies could explore causal relationships using more advanced analytical models such as structural equation modeling (SEM) to better understand the pathways linking management systems and learning outcomes. Comparative studies across countries or educational systems may also provide insights into the generalizability of the Ummi Method and its institutional requirements. Despite these contributions, this study has several limitations. The use of a cross-sectional design with limited longitudinal elements restricts the ability to establish causal relationships. Additionally, reliance on observational data may introduce evaluator bias, although this was mitigated through strong inter-rater reliability measures. Future research is therefore recommended to incorporate experimental or longitudinal designs with extended timeframes to strengthen causal inference.

CONCLUSION

This study addresses the need to move beyond pedagogical-centered analyses in Quranic education by examining how institutional management systems and quality assurance mechanisms shape the effectiveness of Ummi Method implementation across Indonesian educational institutions. The findings demonstrate that overall implementation effectiveness is moderate (M = 3.54), with notable variation across institutions and learning dimensions. Strong performance in instructional preparation contrasts with weaker outcomes in evaluation and closing stages, indicating an imbalance in instructional processes. Most importantly, the study confirms that management effectiveness is the strongest predictor of institutional success (r = 0.67), followed by teacher certification and community engagement, highlighting that educational effectiveness is fundamentally influenced by systemic and organizational factors rather than instructional methods alone.

These findings underscore the importance of adopting a comprehensive institutional approach to improving Quranic education, where administrative capacity, teacher professional development, and structured quality assurance systems are integrated. For practical application, educational institutions should prioritize strengthening management coordination, expanding teacher certification programs, and implementing consistent monitoring systems to ensure sustainable improvement. The study also highlights the need for targeted interventions in community-based institutions, which represent the majority of implementation contexts but exhibit lower levels of professional support. Future research is encouraged to explore causal mechanisms using advanced analytical models and to examine the scalability of institutional frameworks in broader educational contexts, thereby contributing to the development of more effective and sustainable Islamic education systems.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The authors express sincere gratitude to the Beasiswa Indonesia Bangkit (BIB-Kemenag) for providing comprehensive financial support that enabled this research. We acknowledge the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia for its commitment to advancing Islamic education research through this scholarship program. Special appreciation is extended to the Ummi Foundation and the 127 participating educational institutions across Indonesia, whose cooperation and data access facilitated this systematic analysis of the effectiveness of Quranic education. This research contributes to national educational development goals and would not have been feasible without the institutional and financial support provided by BIB-Kemenag.

REFERENCES

Alexander, N. R. (2021). Theory of Sampling Application: Toward a Theory of Tumour Sampling. *Spectroscopy Europe, 33*(4), 31–33. https://doi.org/10.1255/sew.2021.a20

Alghozi, A. A., & Husna, D. (2025). The Ummi Method for Enhancing Quranic Reading Skills: A Study among Housewives. *Jurnal Al Burhan, 5*(2), 353–368. https://doi.org/10.58988/jab.v5i2.599

Arifin, A., & Agustiani, H. (2025). The Role of Taman Pendidikan Al-Qur'an Al Muttaqin in Eradicating Al-Qur'an Illiteracy in Dusun Plelen, Sidoharjo Village, Pacitan. *Al-Mubin: Islamic Scientific Journal, 8*(1), 137–142. https://doi.org/10.51192/almubin.v8i1.1717

Ata Bina Lujjah Fauziyah, D., Wulan Aprilia, D. A., & Munawir. (2025). Analysis of the Effect of Teacher Certification on Improving the Quality of Performance and Professionalism Standards of MI Teacher. *Jurnal Pendidikan Dasar dan Keguruan, 10*(02), 134–140. https://doi.org/10.47435/jpdk.v10i02.3630

Bujang, M., Alias, B. S., & Mansor, A. N. (2025). Evaluating the Content Validity of Instruments for Measuring Principal's Ethical Leadership Practices Using the Content Validity Ratio (CVR) Method. *E-Bangi Journal of Social Science and Humanities, 22*(1). https://doi.org/10.17576/ebangi.2025.2201.08

Encina-Montoya, F., Vega-Aguayo, R., Oberti-Grassau, C., Mardones-Lazcano, A., Muñoz, G., Barrios-Figueroa, R., Alvarado-Flores, C., Reyes-Campos, A., & Urbina-Foneron, M. A. (2025). First Report of Patagonian Toothfish (Dissostichus eleginoides) Metabolic Rate and Its Scaling on a Surface Culture System. *Brazilian Journal of Biology, 84*, e285669. https://doi.org/10.1590/1519-6984.285669

Evi Gusliana, & Nurlela. (2022). Islamic Religious Education in Shaping Character in Higher Education. *Al-Ibda: Jurnal Pendidikan Guru Madrasah Ibtidaiyah, 2*(02), 12–17. https://doi.org/10.54892/jpgmi.v2i02.244

Fang, Z., Lei, L., & Zheng, R. (2025). A Novel Building Sampling Approach Leveraging Data Mining and Stratified Sampling Theory for Energy Optimization. *Energy and Buildings, 330*. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.enbuild.2025.115366

Fedyk, W., Sołtysik, M., Bagińska, J., Kołodziej, M., Cieśliński, W., & Borzyszkowski, J. (2025). Organizational Orientation and the Effectiveness of Regional DMOs.

Journal of Quality Assurance in Hospitality and Tourism. https://doi.org/10.1080/1528008X.2025.2470336

González-Estrada, E., Villaseñor, J. A., & Acosta-Pech, R. (2022). Shapiro-Wilk Test for Multivariate Skew-Normality. *Computational Statistics, 37*(4), 1985–2001. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00180-021-01188-y

Habibi, H. (2024). Revitalization of the Islamic Education Paradigm: An Islamic Epistemological Perspective. *Bestari, 21*(2), 102. https://doi.org/10.36667/bestari.v21i2.1532

Huang, H. T., & Chueh, H. E. (2023). Sustained Improvement of Educational Information Asymmetry: Intentions to Use School Social Media. *Sustainability, 15*(3). https://doi.org/10.3390/su15032676

Iliyasu, R., & Etikan, I. (2021). Comparison of Quota Sampling and Stratified Random Sampling. *Biometrics & Biostatistics International Journal, 10*(1), 24–27. https://doi.org/10.15406/bbij.2021.10.00326

Istaqimi, F., Putri, A. K., & Purwanti, A. (2024). Analysis of Teacher Certification Programs in Improving Teacher Professionalism. *Social, Humanities, and Educational Studies (SHES): Conference Series, 7*(3). https://doi.org/10.20961/shes.v7i3.91628

Köroğlu, M. (2025). Inter-Rater Reliability Analysis in Performance-Based Assessment: A Comparison of Generalizability Coefficients and Rater Consistency. *Ahmet Keleşoğlu Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*. https://doi.org/10.38151/akef.2025.158

Levin, O., & Major, L. (2025). Project-Based Learning as Signature Pedagogy for Developing Teacher Professionalism in Teacher Education. *European Journal of Teacher Education*. https://doi.org/10.1080/02619768.2025.2516057

Li, Y. (2024). The Essential Importance of Vocabulary Instruction in Language Proficiency: An Examination of Methods and Strategies Across Educational Approaches in China. *Journal of Electrical Systems, 20*(11s), 4838–4845. https://doi.org/10.52783/jes.8820

Marquina, M., Gimenez, G., Rodríguez, W., & Mazzeo, I. (2022). Quality Assurance and New Public Management: Transformations in Organizational Structures, Functions and Roles in Argentine Universities. *Quality Assurance in Education, 30*(3), 352–369. https://doi.org/10.1108/QAE-10-2021-0160

Marzi, G., Balzano, M., & Marchiori, D. (2024). K-Alpha Calculator–Krippendorff's Alpha Calculator: A User-Friendly Tool for Computing Krippendorff's Alpha Inter-Rater Reliability Coefficient. *MethodsX, 12*. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.mex.2023.102545

Milosavljevic, M., & Reynolds, B. L. (2024). The Effectiveness of Comprehension-Based Visual Arts Instruction and Production-Based Flashcard Instruction in Young English Language Learners' Vocabulary Acquisition and Retention. *Studies in Second Language Learning and Teaching, 14*(2), 311–338. https://doi.org/10.14746/ssllt.30183

Munda, S. W. (2024). Institutional Internal Quality Assurance Mechanisms in University Education: Is It Effective in Kenya? *International Journal of Education and Social Science Research, 7*(3), 193–209. https://doi.org/10.37500/ijessr.2024.7314

Noprianti, A., Kustati, M., & Gusmirawati, G. (2025). Learning Assistance in Quranic Reading Using the Wafa Method for Elementary School Students. *El-Rusyd, 10*(2), 415–421. https://doi.org/10.58485/elrusyd.v10i2.560

Obeng, V. A., Farooq, M. B., Miglani, S., & Jalali, F. (2025). Sustainability Assurance Quality and Board Gender Diversity: Moderating Role of Assurance Level and Provider Type on the Extent of Assurance Procedures. *Journal of Accounting and Organizational Change, 21*(7), 90–117. https://doi.org/10.1108/JAOC-07-2024-0214

Okunbanjo, O. I., Okunbanjo, O., & Afolabi, B. (2024). Scaling in Quantitative Survey in Management Science Research: The Perspective of Likert Scale. *Annual Journal of Technical University of Varna, Bulgaria, 8*(2), 21–32. https://doi.org/10.29114/ajtuv.vol8.iss2.321

Omirbayev, S. (2023). National Model for Quality Assurance of Education: New Format, Tools and Regulatory Mechanisms. *Education. Quality Assurance, 1*, 41–49. https://doi.org/10.58319/26170493_2023_1_41

Pavlenkov, R. V., & Gizatullin, M. G. (2021). Some Aspects of Implementation of Experimental and Innovation Activity of an Educational Institution Oriented to the Improvement of Learning and Teaching Materials and Material and Technical Support of the Educational System. *Полицейская Деятельность, 4*, 34–48. https://doi.org/10.7256/2454-0692.2021.4.36275

Prihandoko, A., Sunyoto, S., & Sarbini, S. (2024). Implementation of Continuous Improvement to Increase the Efficiency of the Production Process through Press Dies Design. *International Journal of Research and Innovation in Social Science, 8*(9), 618–628. https://doi.org/10.47772/ijriss.2024.809056

Raihanah, R. (2023). The Concept of Self Healing for Children in Islamic Education (Perspective of the Qur'an and Hadith). *Al-Madrasah: Jurnal Pendidikan Madrasah Ibtidaiyah, 7*(2), 565. https://doi.org/10.35931/am.v7i2.2143

Röbken, H., & Schütz, M. (2023). The Development and Re-Forming of Quality Assurance in German Higher Education—An Organizational Reform Perspective. *International Journal of Educational Reform*. https://doi.org/10.1177/10567879231217487

Singgih, E. G. (2023). Religious Moderation as Good Life: Two Responses to the Ministry of Religious Affairs' Directive on Religious Moderation in Indonesia. *Exchange, 52*(3), 220–240. https://doi.org/10.1163/1572543X-bja10038

Strong, B. (2023). Retrieval, Repetition, and Retention: Unveiling Vocabulary Acquisition Strategies for ESL Learners. *Arts & Humanities Open Access Journal, 5*(3), 185–190. https://doi.org/10.15406/ahoaj.2023.05.00206

Suh, J. S., & Vora, M. V. (2025). Co-Designing Mathematics Instruction with ChatGPT: Exploring Mathematics Teacher Pedagogical Expertise in Culturally Responsive and Differentiated Instruction. *Journal of Educational Research in Mathematics, 35*(3), 741–774. https://doi.org/10.29275/jerm.2025.35.3.741

Wang, S., & Zhang, H. (2025). Evaluating the Determinants of Metaverse Learning Benefits in Higher Education: A Mixed-Methods Investigation of System Quality, Institutional Support, and Personal Innovativeness. *Studies in Educational Evaluation, 87*. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.stueduc.2025.101536

Zuhdi, M. (2022). Promoting Religious Literacy through Education in the Multi-Culture Indonesia. *Journal of Public Value, 4*, 37–41. https://doi.org/10.53581/jopv.2022.4.1.37