

INDONESIAN MUFASSIR PERSPECTIVE ON GENDER EQUALITY: STUDY ON TAFSIR AL-MISBAH, TAFSIR AL-AZHAR, AND TAFSIR MARAH LABID

Ach. Zayyadi

Universitas Nurul Jadid, Probolinggo
achzayyadi1984@gmail.com

Alvina Amatillah

Universitas Nurul Jadid, Probolinggo
alvinaamatillah050@gmail.com

Dwiki Oktafiana Wirendri

Universitas Nurul Jadid, Probolinggo
oktafianadwiki28@gmail.com

Abstract: This article aims to figure out Indonesian commentators perspectives on the position of women in the domestic and public sphere. This research comes from the question; Has the patriarchal identity that existed in Indonesia influenced Indonesian commentators perspectives in interpreting the Qur'an? And what is Indonesian commentators perspective on women's leadership in the public sphere? With the literary method and critical analysis of their works, tafsir al-Misbah, Tafsir al-Azhar, and Tafsir Marāḥ Labīd, this research resulted in the following findings and conclusions. *First*, in essence, the three Indonesian commentators did not give permission to women to become leaders in the household, even they have different reasons. Nawāwī al-Bantānī considers men to be leaders for their wives, because men has the potential to educate them, has intellectual and physical strength. Hamka gave consideration to Indonesian traditions and culture. Meanwhile, Quraish Shihab argues that a man is the leader over his wife because of the psychological and character considerations of men who are more assertive.

Second, regarding women's leadership in the public sphere, Quraish Shihab and Hamka allow women to become leaders for men as long as they have sufficient criteria. Meanwhile al-Nawāwī did not provide a clear explanation of the status of women's leadership in the public sphere. The findings in this study also confirm that, in addressing the problem of women, the Indonesian commentators has a paradigm shift from time to time, this is due to sociological factors and conditions surrounding the interpreter.

Keywords: Shifting paradigm; women's equality; Indonesian exegesis.

Introduction

The status of women in Islam is still a very interesting issue and invites various polemic groups, from scholars, mufassirs, academics, even young people today. Historical facts prove that throughout the history of Islam, men were in a superior position, while women were always placed in an inferior position, and this is known as the patriarchal paradigm. This occurs due to the interpretation of classical commentators who tend to be in a patriarchal culture so that women are unable to compete at both the domestic and public levels.¹

The discourse of women in Islam derives legitimacy from a number of sources, one of which is in the Qur'an, which is an object that must be led by men (read Surah al-Nisā': 34), but that does not mean that women are in a position that is marginalized and discredited by men, giving the impression that only men have the right to lead and women are not. Because, it is God's promise that they each have their own privileges. In this verse, leadership in the sphere of the household (family) is only mandated to men and this is one of the privileges that Allah has given to men and will never be replaced by women, regardless of

¹ Billy K. Sarwono, "Gender Bias in a Patriarchal Society A Media Analysis on Virginity and Reproductive Health," *Wacana, Journal of the Humanities of Indonesia* 14, no. 1 (2012): 37, <https://doi.org/10.17510/wjhi.v14i1.48>.

the conditions that support men. the reins of leadership remain in the hands of men in the domestic sphere.²

However, this verse was made by the salaf ulama as an argument for the incompetence of women to act as leaders in the public sphere, more specifically in the political realm, and the view of this salaf ulama discriminates against women based on this verse, so that this verse is gender biased.³

The phenomenon of women in the modern era, such as today, is that women appear to be leaders by occupying various important positions both in large (public) and small (domestic) societies. Because of that, they sue for gender equality. Because so far the products of Islamic Law thought, both contained in classical fiqh books and classical interpretations, contain gender injustice. The origin of gender injustice in Islamic law lies in the inner contradiction between the ideals of sharia and the socio-cultural norms of the Muslim community. However, the current phenomenon is that both Islamic texts, tafsir or fiqh are often used to reject gender equality. This was done to maintain the status quo and legalize a patriarchal lifestyle that gave men special privileges and tended to corner women.⁴

Along with the progress of scientific transformation, several prominent Indonesian commentators have contributed greatly to the development of nusantara interpretation.⁵ They are actively writing works in the field of interpretation of the Qur'an in an effort to make it easier for Muslims to understand the contents of the Qur'an. The interpretation of the Qur'an in Indonesia is also

² Nelly van Doorn-Harder, "PURIFYING INDONESIA, PURIFYING WOMEN," *CrossCurrents* 69, no. 3 (January 29, 2019): 301–18, <https://doi.org/10.2307/26842580>.

³ Ch Mufidah, "Complexities in Dealing with Gender Inequality: Muslim Women and Mosque-Based Social Services in East Java Indonesia," *Journal of Indonesian Islam* 11, no. 2 (2017): 459–88, <https://doi.org/10.15642/JIIS.2017.11.2.459-488>.

⁴ Abu Rokhmad and Sulistiyono Susilo, "Conceptualizing Authority of the Legalization of Indonesian Women's Rights in Islamic Family Law," *Journal of Indonesian Islam* 11, no. 2 (2017): 489–508, <https://doi.org/10.15642/JIIS.2017.11.2.489-508>.

⁵ Rifa Roifa, Rosihon Anwar, and Dadang Darmawan, "Perkembangan Tafsir Di Indonesia (Pra Kemerdekaan 1900-1945)," *Al-Bayan: Jurnal Studi Ilmu Al-Qur'an Dan Tafsir* 2, no. 1 (2017): 21–36.

carried out in conjunction with efforts to reform Islam and the movement for interpreting the Qur'an in Egypt and other countries, so that there is no longer any reason for Indonesian Muslims, both their nation and their descendants, to not understand the contents of the Qur'an, because the interpretation of the Qur'an is not only written in Arabic, even the interpretation is written in various regional languages such as; Sundanese,⁶ Javanese,⁷ Malay and Indonesian follow their birthplace and place of spread of knowledge.⁸

From that explanation, this article will examine Nusantara commentators perspective of the equal status of women and the position of women in the domestic and public sphere. This research also will analyze the shift of interpretation from Nawāwī al-Bantānī to the contemporary Indonesian commentator, Quraish Shihab. The three figures of interpretation are samples in research who lived in different times in Indonesia.

Women's Leadership Discourse On Indonesian Tafsir

Some researchers argue that a commentator cannot avoid the culture and social context that surrounds him.⁹ More than that, it cannot be denied that the interpretations produced by the interpreters can also shape and construct a patriarchal culture. This cannot be separated from the influence of the socio-cultural conditions where the commentator lives. Because an interpretation of the results is not only born from the methods and approaches

⁶ Jajang A. Rohmana, "Alquran Dan Bahasa Sunda Populer: Respons Generasi Milenial Terhadap Terjemahan Alquran Bahasa Sunda," *Al-Bayan: Jurnal Studi Ilmu Al-Qur'an Dan Tafsir* 4, no. 2 (2020): 93–110, <https://doi.org/10.15575/al-bayan.v4i2.8008>.

⁷ Abdul Mustaqim, "The Epistemology of Javanese Qur'anic Exegesis: A Study of Sālih Darat's *Fayd Al-Rahmān*," *Al-Jami'ah* 55, no. 2 (2017): 357–90, <https://doi.org/10.14421/ajis.2017.552.357-390>.

⁸ Hasani Ahmad Said, "Mengenal Tafsir Nusantara: Melacak Mata Rantai Tafsir Dari Indonesia, Malaysia, Thailand, Singapura Hingga Brunei Darussalam," *Refleksi*, 2018, <https://doi.org/10.15408/ref.v16i2.10193>.

⁹ Ahmad Fawaid and Nafi'ah Mardlatillah, "Bias Ideologis Tafsir Hizb Al-Tahrir," *MAGHZA: Jurnal Ilmu Al-Qur'an Dan Tafsir* 5, no. 2 (2020): 184–209, <https://doi.org/10.24090/maghza.v5i2.4243>.

used by the interpreters, but is also influenced by their socio-cultural conditions and ideology.¹⁰

The previous idea cannot be separated from the strong patriarchal culture that has grown in Indonesia for centuries. In the classical exegesis of Islam, there are several controversial issues related to gender, including the origin of the creation of women, inheritance, testimony, leadership, and polygamy.¹¹ The classical mufassir shows the verses that explains about women with a gender-biased and discriminatory view of women, and usually this problem arises from the understanding of QS. al-Nisā ‘: 34. From this verse, a long debate framed in a Gender discourse.

Zaitunah Subhan argues that, the word “*al-Rijāl Qawwāmūna ‘alā al-Nisā’*” consists of muftada and khabar arrangements. Al-Rijālū as muftada (main sentence) and Qawwāmūna as Khabar (predicate). In other words, the sentence is not a legal decision (juridical), but a statement (*kalam khabarī*), so that the accuracy of the mandatory or haram law is less effective. Therefore, this verse does not use an editorial “O men, you are obliged to be a leader, or vice versa” O women, you must accept being led by a man.¹²

Al-Wāhidī in his work, *Asbāb Nuzūl al-Qur’ān*, explains that QS. al-Nisā’: 34 was revealed in connection with the case of the wife of Sa’ad bin Rabī’ (an Ansar leader), his wife Ḥabībah bint Zayd bin Abī Zuhair was invited to have sex, but refused. Then Sa’ad slapped him. on the act of Sa’ad, his wife complained to the Prophet SAW. Then the Prophet ordered Ḥabībah to stay away from her husband, and Sa’ad would be punished by Qishas for her disrespect. However, when Ḥabībah came with his father to do Qishas, suddenly the Prophet SAW called them both saying: “Jibril came to me, Allah sent down His word which means:” men are

¹⁰ Ibid.

¹¹ Ahmad Fawaid and Thoriqotul Faizah, “A Sociolinguistic Analysis of Sword Verses,” *Al Quds Jurnal Studi Al-Qur’an Dan Hadis* 5 (2021): 119–40, <https://doi.org/10.29240/alquds.v5i1.2315>.

¹² Zaitunah Subhan, *Tafsir Kebencian, Studi Bias Gender Dalam Al-Qur’an* (Yogyakarta: LKiS, 1999), 142.

Qawwam for women “Furthermore he said: “He wants something but Allah wishes another”¹³

Based on the information in Asbab al-Nuzul, the context of the verse is not related to leadership. On the contrary, contextually the verse relates to cases of domestic violence (KDRT). Therefore, the verse statement is not Normative-Juridical (Law), but the verse is more on the Sociological Aspect. Zaitunah Subhan said that this verse explicitly emphasizes the leadership of men towards women only applies in the household, because this verse is related to Habibah’s nusyuz to her husband Sa’ad, and it is very inappropriate to make this verse an argument for male leadership. men against women.¹⁴

Problems of Women’s Leadership in the Domestic Domain

The term women’s leadership is a trending topic that remains warm to continue to be discussed and the interpretation of the archipelago mufassir into a problems with the term, because in this problem the archipelago commentator do not allow women to be leaders in the scope of the family (domestic), so that the term “women’s leadership” can fade with it.¹⁵

This interpretation of the Nusantara mufassir. Family leadership (domestic) is basically not leadership leads to power, but to establish goodness, direct, and educate. Normative justification in domestic (family) leadership, can be found in QS. al-Nisā ‘: 34. In this verse, the archipelago mufassir has its own characteristics interpret as described as follows:

Imam Nawawi al-Jawi’s perspective

Sheikh Nawawi in interpreting the word *Qanwām* is male as female leaders, meaning men (husbands) have the power to educate wife (*Musallatunā ‘ala ta’dibihinna*) because Allah gives an advantage to a

¹³ ‘Alī Ibn Ahmad Al-Wāhidī, *Asbāb Nuzūl Al-Qur’an* (Kairo: Dār al-Kitāb al-Jadīd, 1969), 144.

¹⁴ Zaitunah Subhan, *Al-Quran Dan Perempuan* (Jakarta: PRENADAMEDIA GROUP, 2015), 13.

¹⁵ Ahmad Fawaid, “Filologi Naskah Tafsīr Bi Al-Imlā’ Surat Al-Baqarah Karya Kyai Zaini Mun’im,” *Jurnal Studi Ilmu-Ilmu Al-Qur’an Dan Hadis* 20, no. 2 (2019): 143, <https://doi.org/10.14421/qh.2019.2002-02>.

man. In interpreting the word al-Fadl Sheikh Nawawī interprets it with “male.” has the advantage of using reason, as well as manage as well take care, sincerity in thinking, and have a better strength in work matters and obedience to God. Because of this men have the privilege of being a Prophet, leader, ruler, shari’ah of Allah, and, witnesses in terms of judges’ decisions, have the obligation of jihad, Friday prayers, etc. This is the first reason that men are top leader of women. Whereas the reason that both men have power over women, that is because men (husbands) spend their wealth (husbands) well for dowry or income.¹⁶

Then the next verse that: “good woman (*al-ṣāliḥah*), ie women (led) should be obedient to their husbands. Whereas “women who keep things hidden in a way that is preserved by God “. That is, women are obliged to look after themselves when there are no good husbands public and the treasure. When a person takes care of her husband’s rights, God will too guard against the rights of the wife is to be fair, look after them by doing good, and rewarding them.¹⁷ Then, if a husband finds a woman who is not good by doing *nushūz* (defiance) then the husband should advise in a manner educate and even if the wife remains nush, then the next solution is the husband parting with a wife that is a husband turned his face when being in bed and besides that the husband away from the wife who is nusyuz with no hang it out. and the last solution when nushuz happens to the wife (led) ie the husband (leader) has the right to hit as long as it is not painful and can be give used, but more not to hit, and when to hit his is mandatory so it is not allowed that can harm the wife. (Muhammad bin Umar Nawawi al-Jawi, 1417 H).¹⁸

Hamka’s perspective on Tafsir al-Azhar

In interpreting the word “*Qanwām*” Hamka interprets with “leader” so that it leads to the understanding that men are leaders women. However, in this verse the commandment does not come immediately say “O men must be for you to be a leader and you

¹⁶ Muhammad bin ‘Umar Nawawi Al-Jawi, *Marāb Labid*, 1st ed. (Beirūt: Dār al-Kutub al-‘Alamiyah, n.d.), 195

¹⁷ Ibid, 197.

¹⁸ Ibid, 198.

women, will receive leadership. Even if this verse is in the form command but this is contrary to reality. Because the reality is indeed men are the leaders of women. This verse is more consistent with kalam khabar (Preaching) not amr (command). Besides this Hamka said that “Men are women leaders, not women who lead men, and not the same position between women and Male”. That is, in this case Hamka prefers men to position superior while women are inferior position. So this indicates that absolute leadership in the family is a man’s right. As Hamka’s words in his book that “In the household there can be no two powers with equal rights and obligations because there must be a leader in there”.¹⁹

No matter how modern a household is, the final decision remains in men. In a household there cannot be two powers with the same rights and obligations, there must be a leader. The leader, according to physical and spiritual events, humans are nothing but men. When someone increases intelligence to think then will be more amenable to this. So on this basis, religious law will be upheld. So the news in the Qur’an that men are leaders for women are not only news and news reality, but it has become a command, because such is the rhythm of life that is walk.²⁰

God made man (husband) as a leader because God had exaggerate some of them (men) over some others (women), i.e. more in terms of energy, intelligence, and responsibility. For example; a standing household consisting of father, wife and children. By itself, though without the command “man” who holds leadership in the family the. So this verse explains a fact that should be men who are leaders over women. In addition, if in a families have “stupid men and smart women”, so then leadership in the family turns to women, contrary to the proposition which says that “something that rarely happens cannot be argued law”.²¹

In matters of property it is indeed the responsibility of men, for example in Minangkabau custom, when the property belongs to both of us husband and wife known as “Harato Suarang” in

¹⁹ Hamka, *Tafsir Al-Azhar*, 7th ed. (Jakarta: Pustaka Panjimas, 1983), 146.

²⁰ Ibid, 147.

²¹ Ibid, 148.

other words treasure gono-gini, then the last right in determining remains a man.

In Islam, men are required to pay dowry to their married wives. Mahar seems to contain unwritten laws about responsibility replied, that when the dowry was paid, the wife indirectly gave up her leadership to her husband. And when the wife is given a living then women it is the responsibility of men and men at that time are entitled to become because the leader has fulfilled the rights of his wife and child.²²

Hamka categorizes this verse as the character of someone who is led (wife) by husband. Is a “good woman” that is a woman who is obedient, responsible responsible in the household both in property and education of children. “that preserving hidden matters in a way that is preserved by God “. Meaning, that in the household there must be something that must be kept secret regarding with the relationship of beds, living and the like. And this is a courtesy drink for every human. Because when women or wife obedient then walk leader man (husband) smoothly, and because of this the family will happy. It is different if the opposite happens, that is the behavior (wife) it no longer reflects the righteous wife with all its qualities. Then the next verse goes that “the woman that you are worried about will be flush” then the right for a household leader (husband) to do three things when a person who is led (wife) is disobedient and obedient to both the husband or to Allah; the first way is “then teach them” which is a teaching by giving a conscious effect on something done and deep giving this teaching a leader (husband) should be firm and wise. Then the second is by separating the bed. So, if later the woman still has the right for her husband to use the most abusive methods among others.²³

M. Quraish Shihab’s perspective in Tafsir al-Misbah

Every man and woman has their own privileges as has been bestowed by God among others for each of them has functions and obligations that must be carried out in society, accordingly

²² Ibid, 149.

²³ Ibid, 150.

with the potential and the tendency of its kind. Therefore, the Qur'an forbids daydreaming and jealousy about the strengths that God gives. This is related closely (Qs. an-Nisā': 34) which says that men (husbands), are *Qanwām* is the leader and the person in charge of the women because of God has appointed men as leaders with two main considerations, namely: exaggerating some of them over the others and having provided a living. So that men become leaders in the family. The majority of scholars understand the word *al-Rijālū* in this verse with husbands, but in the book *Insights into the Qur'an*, Quraish Shihab explained that the word *al-rijal*, does not mean men in general because of the consistent statement above, as emphasized in the continuation of the verse that is "those (husbands) who spend a portion of his wealth is for their wives."²⁴

Among men and women have their respective privileges. But the privileges that men have further support the task of leadership than the privileges that women have. On the other hand, the privilege owned by women further supports their duties as givers of peace and calm to men and more support its function in educating and raising his children. And Quraish Shihab, likened this in line with an expression that says that "Function creates form or form adapted to the function". Like, a knife created sharp and sharp, created so because it serves to cut, while the glass lip is created thick and smooth because it functions to drink. If the shape of the knife is the same as the shape glass, it will be dangerous and fail in its function. If the knife is shaped like a glass, its presence is useless and also fails in its function.²⁵

As described by French historian Maurice Bardeche in his book *Histoire De Femmes*—quoted by Quraish Shihab in the *Tafsir al-Misbah*, which says that equating men and women in all things means giving birth the third type, which is not the type of male and female, because in self each man and woman have differences both physically and psychologically. The difference between men and women in psychic terms is that of men tends to sports, hunting, and work that involves movement. In the appeal of

²⁴ M Quraish Shihab, *Tafsir Al-Misbah*, Jakarta: Lentera Hati, vol. 2 (Jakarta: Lentera Hati, 2002), 509.

²⁵ Ibid, 512.

women, men tend more to challenges and fights, whereas women tend to peace and friendliness; more men aggressive and prefers to conquer, whereas women are more calm and peaceful. Male tend to use violence like suicide while women are more avoid violence both towards him or others.²⁶

Therefore the amount fewer women commit suicide than men. Whereas from the very physical it's clear that men are stronger in this regard. The word *Anfaqu* is a form of the past tense verb meaning "to spend" shows that giving a living to women has become a norm for men and a general reality in society since then until now. Such is the case that it is illustrated with the form of past verbs that show a long time ago. The mention of the preamble by this verse shows that old habit still valid today. "A good woman (*al-ṣāliḥah*)" is a woman who is obedient to her husband to listen to it and follow it when a husband rules as well fulfill between the rights of both parties. However, suppose that happens conversely those who are led (wives) do *nushuz*, there are three things that the husband needs to do in carrying out his leadership in maintaining *Mahligai* marriage, and the three ways are steps that must be done in sequence as stated in the Qur'an.²⁷

The first step is to "leave" this as a sign displeasure of the husband (household leader) to the bad character of the wife (*nushūz*), other than that to achieve something better than the original state. While the second step is "separating the bed" in this case the husband just separated bed but not to separate rooms especially houses. Then "Beating" this is the last step used by house leaders stairs (husband) in fostering the household and the meaning of hitting is not only by harsh and abusive actions.²⁸

Problems Of Women's Leadership In The Public Sphere The Nawawi al-Jawi perspective

In interpreting "The Story of the Leadership of Queen Bilqis" Imam Nawawī does not provide a clear law on whether or not "The Story of Queen Bilqis" serve as an argument for the ability of women to become leaders. The nature of the leadership of

²⁶ Ibid, 515.

²⁷ Ibid, 517.

²⁸ Ibid, 519.

Queen Bilqis according to Imam Nawawi in the Book *Angry Labid's* interpretation is as follows:

An Unauthorized and Wise Queen

“Queen Balqis said to her prince: I have never made a decision the matter before you witness directly (being in my assembly) “(Qs. al-Naml verse 32). The custom of Queen Balqis when there is a matter of kingdom is to present court officials and deliberation with them. The dignitary too answer: “We have physical and financial strength and have enough the courage to fight them in battle, is the final decision in the hands of His Majesty (the Queen), then carefully consider the things to be your majesty command and we will obey you”.²⁹

Able to lead the country in a safe and prosperous way (diplomatically) Professional

When Queen Balqis felt that the princes were more inclined towards war, then the Queen is not willing if there must be a war when Queen Balqis know of the person who subdues (and sends) birds (Hud-Hud) by means of (sending a letter to the Queen) it is not weak. That matter (the Queen's unwillingness) is known through clear instructions from the letter that she (the Queen Balqis) accept, even Queen Balqis is more inclined to make peace. Therefore Ratu Balqis explained while she was at war “actually the Kings if they enter a country by war, they will damage it by knocking down existing buildings and damaging property and make its inhabitants despised by being taken prisoner, killed and expelled which makes them despicable. And that's what they do, Truly when people send letters they will do what do the kings, that's their habit “. Then the queen has a solution by giving gifts, saying: “I will send messengers with give a gift (as a sign of peace) and I will wait for what you will brought back by my messenger “³⁰

²⁹ Nawāwī, *Marah Labid*, II., 173.

³⁰ Ibid, II., 174.

Hamka's perspective

In reviewing the story of the Queen of Balqis As contained in QS. al-An'ām: 29-31 Hamka described how the queen delivered the letter that she got by first, stating the nature a letter that said letter (noble), second: mentioning the sender of the letter viz (Sulaiman), third: mention the rules of the letter by using lafal (*Bismi Allah al-Rahmān al-Rahīm*), and the last mention of the purpose of gathering royal authorities by describing the contents of the letter that came from Solomon which reads (Don't be arrogant) In the letter hints at some of the qualities possessed by the Queen Balqis as a leader of the Saba kingdom.³¹

Clever-Scholar and Wise

In this case Hamka said that the Queen of Balqis was said clever on the grounds that the Saba's dignitaries must be first consider when trying to reply to a letter so as not to be careless and rash in making decisions. So that the Queen of Saba 'arranged a strategy in deliver the letter. In addition, Hamka said that Queen Saba ' it is a wise queen based on how when The queen delivered the letter.³²

Democratic

After receiving a letter from the Prophet Sulaiman as stated in the previous verse Ratu Balqis then asked for opinions on para the Saba community's magnate on the matter as is stated in Qs. an-Naml verse 32, meaning: Said him (Balqis): "O officials! give me consideration in my business (this), I never decide on anything the matter before you are in (my) assembly ". The verse shows how democratic Queen Balqis was not decide the case with his own will but rather to consider the opinions of others who are involved in the problem the. This means in deciding a case by way of deliberation although deliberation is not an obligation in deciding case in a country. Actually in this case the full power is deep addressing these problems is the power of the Queen because the Queen has the right absolute in deciding the case. And the magnificent Saba community surrender all these problems to Ratu

³¹ Hamka, *Tafsir Al-Azhar*, XIX., 207.

³² Ibid, XIX., 208.

Balqis so this matter indicates that the community includes people who have the authority and Wise.³³

Political Strategist and State Science Expert

These properties are as contained in QS. al-Naml: 34 which shows that “when a King (Solomon) entered into something State and conquer, if the defense of a conquered State is not fight from the beginning the State will be damaged by a State will be safe because the structure of government is orderly and has either war strategy or otherwise. But when other countries enter the country we (Balqis) with the gallant and the rules will be changed then there will arise a damage and the country will be despised. This shows the state of science taught by Ratu Balqis was on his dignitaries and this was revealed by Allah as revelation to the Prophet Muhammad and this is a guide for the Ummah Muhammad forever and ever. Namely if a foreign power enters conquering a State then a noble person in that State become despicable. But if the country is against, defend with their mighty independence the leaders will become prisoners, while captives are despicable. In Qs. an-Naml verse 34 indicates the existence of ability women become leaders based on Hamka’s interpretation of This verse means that it is legitimate when someone uses the relevant verse with the story of Ratu Balqis as the legal proposition of the ability of women to be Public (State) leader with a record of meeting the criteria for being a leader and expert in state science, but in this case Hamka is not too bright in providing legal certainty, as Hamka said in the book of exegesis is al-Azhar. The exact science of state is taught by Balqis, and later revealed by God as a revelation to the Prophet Muhammad, and this be a guide for us (the people of Muhammad) forever and ever. In this verse is an interpretation of Hamka in addressing verse 34 regarding “when Queen Balqis taught about state science for the authorities of the Saba’ites. So this indicates that when a woman is an expert in state science she has space to become a leader.

³³ Ibid, XIX, 207.

Diplomatic

This diplomatic attitude is taken, with the reason that peace the people are not disturbed and peace and good partners occur between One country to another by giving gifts as a sign peace. As stated in Qs. an-Naml verse 35 “And verily I will send messengers to them by bringing (gift), and (I will) wait for what the messengers will bring back “.34

Quraish Shihab’s Perspective

Quraish Shihab has never banned women from becoming public leaders meaning that women still have room to be leaders of a country (public), as the statement of Quraish Shihab states that “leadership public areas are submitted following the eligibility and abilities of a person from either men or women “.35 So when someone is qualified and deserves to be a leader even from the group this woman remains right. the eligibility criteria can be linked with criteria owned by the Balqis queen. But the Quraish of Shihab does not justify when the verse pertains with the leadership of the Balqis queen being made as a legal foundation due the verse came down not in the context of “should women’s leadership” but it’s just a story that happened in the past. Some of the abilities of the glorious Queen Balqis in his leadership as in “Tafsir al-Misbah” including the following:

Wise and Democratic

After receiving the call of the Prophet Sulaiman not to be arrogant and surrender, he did not immediately decide the case. However ask for consideration from the leaders of the government pictured in verse 32, which means: Said him (Balqis): “O authorities, grant me consideration in my (this) business, I never decide on a matter before you are in (my) assembly “. This shows, the queen is a type of leader who wise and democratic, not being authoritarian without considering other people’s opinions. He gave the royal leaders the opportunity to give opinions, even though the final decision is in his hands. And way this is what Islam pursues. As

³⁴ Ibid, XIX., 210.

³⁵ Muhammad Quraish Shihab, *Perempuan* (Tangerang: Lentera Hati, 2012), 379.

stated by Quraish Shihab, quoting from Ibn Asyur's words that: "Although the verse describes the deliberations that were carried out by the Queen, but this verse does not necessarily serve as a basis for said that Islam advocates deliberation. Because this verse does not speak in a legal context, nor praise it. But the verse is a description of events that occur in a society that does not adheres to teachings based on Divine revelation. However, it needs to be remembered that the Qur'an tells a story is to be picked from the story it is a teaching and example and based on these considerations, it can withdrawn from these verses the impression of the need for deliberation."³⁶

Prioritizing People's Welfare and Peace

The attitude of the Balqis queen in deciding what to do in facing the threat of Prophet Sulaiman, very concerned about the condition of his people. This is reflected in his words in verse 34, which means: "He said: "Indeed, when kings enter a land, surely they will destroy it, and make its noble people despicable; so will they do ". This illustrates how his love and caring against the fate of its people in the event of war. Therefore he refused on the advice of his royal leaders to fight."³⁷

Liking Peace

This diplomatic attitude is taken, with the reason that peace its people are not disturbed. It was customary for ancient kings, when they want to make friends with other kingdoms, they are sending gifts as a sign of peace. This is illustrated in (verse 35): "And verily I will send messengers to them by bringing (gift), and (I will) wait for what the messengers will bring back that". In addition to protecting its people from damage and the misery caused by war, this is also done by the queen Balqis to create peace with the Prophet Sulaiman.

Quraish Shihab mentions in his interpretation of the story of the queen of Balqis as stated in the Qur'an by formulating some of the properties possessed by the Balqis queen when leading the

³⁶ Shihab, *Tafsir Al-Misbah*, X., 215-217.

³⁷ Ibid, X., 220.

Saba country ‘that the queen was wise, democratic, and good at governance. So when there is someone who fulfills the requirements as possessed by Queen Balqis in particular good at governance but in this case is not allowed by Quraish Shihab takes the legal proposition (*Istinbāt al-Aḥkām*) from “Acts Balqis leadership “will enable women to become leaders when has criteria such as Balqis, as the statement of Quraish Shihab, as following: “The story cannot be used as a basis (legal basis) with in the name of the Qur’an about whether or not a woman can be the leader of the head of the State or government. Because this verse does not put forward in that context “. So the statement indicates that Quraish Shihab disagree when the argument about the “Balqis story” is used as a foundation the law in determining whether or not women can be leaders in the public sphere.

Thus, that the verse relating to the Balqis story is only enough as a story illustrated in the Qur’an that occurred at the time then and in the matter of responding to the verse, Quraish Shihab did not give legal certainty will be allowed or not women become leaders in the public sphere, based on the Balqis story contained in the Qur’an. By therefore this has become its own problematic because “the story Balqis “in society is often used as a proposition to allow women become leaders by groups who agree women become leaders in the State (Public) the fundamental reason for this is that Queen Balqis leadership at that time was victorious, wise, and democratic.³⁸

Similarities And Differences In Interpretation Of Domestic And Public Spaces

The Equation of Interpretation of Mufassir Nusantara

The basic interpretation interpretation between the three exegetes of the archipelago that in “domestic (family) leadership” the qawwam is male so that the family is more suited to using the term “male leadership (husband)”. As for the equation of interpretation they are related to “Public leadership”, these three commentaries allowed women to be public leader.

³⁸ Ibid, X., 221.

Domestic realm

Based on the exposure that has been done in terms of substance, equation in interpreting the verse between Imam Nawawi, Buya Hamka, and M. Quraish Shihab explained that “men are leaders over women”. That means (husband) is the leader of (wife) so that it can be said that the three commentators this puts men in a superior position while women in the position inferior. So that women do not get the slightest room to be a leader in the domestic (domestic) realm because full power is in the hands of men (husbands) with some consideration of the advantages of being bestowed by God on men (husbands) and the advantages possessed by good men in terms of physical, psychological, and material. It can be concluded that the basic equation of the three commentators is namely that Qs. an-Nisa ‘verse 34 is related to the realm of leadership domestic. And the basic equation from these three commentators is that “men That Becomes Leader for women (*Qanwām*)”.

Public Domain

Based on the discussion that has been stated above, an overview is taken that the three commentators glorified the leadership led by Balqis, as the following picture: Queen Balqis is a leader (queen) who good at governing. Because a big kingdom is impossible controlled except by people who are experts in government science. And the queen of Balqis is an ideal leader. But that’s from the worldly side, the queen’s leadership Balqis has almost no defects, blemishes, and weaknesses at all even though he is is a woman. So someone’s success in leading is not measured from the sex, but more to the abilities and charisma in running the government. So the fundamental equation is at between the three commentators that is in terms of describing the properties possessed by the Balqis queen in leading the Saba ‘who was brilliant in his leadership.

Differences in Interpretation of Mufassir Nusantara

The fundamental difference between the exegete of the archipelago in interpreting “Domestic leadership” that is in terms of considerations held by men who bestowed on God. Imam

Nawawi is more about physical strength, male intellect, and rights to educate women. While Hamka is more towards social reality, and Quraish Shihab interpreted it by combining social-psychological and psychological reality. While the differences in interpretation between the three architects in the archipelago “Public leadership” in terms of “taking the argument of law (*Istinbāt al-Aḥkām*)” towards the story of the Queen of Balqis about the ability of women to become leaders. That matter said to be different because between these three commentators have a point of view different because different heads have different thoughts.

Domestic realm

Imam Nawawī al-Bantānī

While the fundamental difference in this case, Imam Nawawi said that “men have an advantage in using reason, as well as possible organize and take care, sincerity in thinking, having better strength in terms of work and obedience to God. By because of that men have the privilege of being both a Prophet, leadership, authorities, shari’ah enforcers of Allah, and witnesses in terms of decisions the judge, has the obligation of jihad, and Friday prayers, etc. “Besides things In interpreting this verse Imam Nawawi rests on contextualization verse (*asbāb al-nuzūl*) at that time relating to the case of Sa’ad bin Abi Rabbi ‘who refused her husband’s invitation to have sex.³⁹ Meanwhile, the majority of scholars interpret this word as “leader”. Thing this is not in line if it is associated with aspects of *asbab al-nuzul* QS. al-Nisā’: 34, because the verse came down not in the context of socio-political life, but in domestic life. Therefore interpret with

“Leader” and relate it to the political or leadership context the public is very inappropriate. Although all three interpretations tend to be patriarchy. That is, placing men in a superior position (above) whereas women are inferior position (below).

³⁹ Al-Jāwī, *Marah Labid*, 195.

Buya Hamka

Buya Hamka considered and stated this based on a two to one part comparison of male inheritance and women, men's obligations to pay dowry, and orders to their husbands to treat his wife well. But the fundamental difference in interpreting the verse, Buya Hamka, is more of a sociological meaning "Men become leaders over women" is more the reality that goes on society, namely that in the community "men who become leaders women"⁴⁰

Quraish Shihab

While the consideration of Quraish Shihab is due to the special features men, both physically and psychologically, aside from men support and give dowry to a woman. And the differences are fundamental between Quraish Shihab with other archipelago mufassir, namely Quraish Shihab is more to the Sociological-Psychological means that men become the top leaders women in the domestic realm that in the reality of male society are be a leader. In addition, the most fundamental difference in interpreting The verse is psychological, meaning that men deserve to be the top leaders women, namely from the psychological side (mental) because in this case, research prove that men are stronger mentally than women.⁴¹

Domestic Realm

Imam Nawawi al-Bantani

While the fundamental difference in this case, Imam Nawawi said that "men have an advantage in using reason, as well as possible organize and take care, sincerity in thinking, having better strength in terms of work and obedience to God. By because of that men have the privilege of being both a Prophet, leadership, authorities, shari'ah enforcers of Allah, and witnesses in terms of decisions the judge, has the obligation of jihad, and Friday prayers, etc. ". Besides things In interpreting this verse Imam Nawawi rests on contextualization verse (asbab al-nuzul) at that time relating to the case of Sa'ad bin Abi Rabbi 'who refused her husband's invitation

⁴⁰ Hamka, *Tafsir Al-Azhar*, 46.

⁴¹ Shihab, *Tafsir Al-Misbah*, 513.

to have sex (al-Jawi, 1417 H) Meanwhile, the majority of scholars interpret this word as “leader”. Thing this is not in line if it is associated with aspects of asbab al-nuzul QS. an-Nisa ‘verse 34, because the verse came down not in the context of socio-political life, but in domestic life. Therefore interpret with

“Leader” and relate it to the political or leadership context the public is very inappropriate. Although all three interpretations tend to be patriarchy. That is, placing men in a superior position (above) whereas women are inferior position (below).

Buya Hamka

Buya Hamka considered and stated this based on a two to one part comparison of male inheritance and women, men’s obligations to pay dowry, and orders to their husbands to treat his wife well. But the fundamental difference in interpreting the verse, Buya Hamka, is more of a sociological meaning “Men become leaders over women” is more the reality that goes on society, namely that in the community “men who become leaders women.”

Quraish Shihab

While the consideration of Quraish Shihab is due to the special features men, both physically and psychologically, aside from men support and give dowry to a woman. And the differences are fundamental between Quraish Shihab with other archipelago mufassir, namely Quraish Shihab is more to the Sociological-Psychological means that men become the top leaders women in the domestic realm that in the reality of male society are be a leader. In addition, the most fundamental difference in interpreting The verse is psychological, meaning that men deserve to be the top leaders women, namely from the psychological side (mental) because in this case, research prove that men are stronger mentally than women.

Public Domain

Imam Nawawi

Imam Nawawi will allow leadership in women the public sphere, but Imam Nawawi did not give a legal ruling clear between the

permissibility of making “the story of the queen of Balqis” as a basis the law on the ability of women to become public leaders.

Buya Hamka

A fundamental difference from Hamka in interpreting the verse about the story of Ratu Balqis that Hamka allows women’s leadership in the public sphere so in this case Hamka provides space for women to become leaders. And Hamka justifies women become a leader based on the story of the queen of Saba ‘who is an expert in in the state administration sector besides having some leadership characteristics. So it can be concluded that women can be leaders with notes experts in state administration and meet the criteria to be a leader in the realm Public.

Quraish Shihab

The difference between Quraish Shihab in interpreting verses relating to Balqis leadership (an-Naml 29-35) that Quraish Shihab was not confirmed the story as a legal basis for a person’s ability women become leaders, this is different from the Hamka confirming the Balqis story is used as a legal basis women become leaders in the public sphere. But Quraish Shihab requires must meet the criteria like a leader and expert in field of state administration.

The Relevance Of Interpretation Of Mufassir Nusantara To Women’s Leadership In Indonesia

Women have a noble place in Islam. Islam does not put women in subordinate positions in community life. Domestic role and the female public can work in a balanced way. As an Indonesian citizen, women have the right to politicize and carry out their social roles expressly, transparent, and protected. Public roles for women are permitted throughout the woman has the ability to not forget the domestic role. The domestic role of women is maintaining the integrity of the household and this is the main task that cannot be left in any situation. Public role should not be done by marginalizing domestic roles so that the balance of roles domestic and public will strengthen harmonious national and state life and synergistic. Women become calm career in the public

sector because of the conditions his family is harmonious. Husband and children can accept career women's decisions because their rights are still well fulfilled. It takes a hard struggle for the para women's activities to maintain balance in her family. Do not let too late in his public activities which made him forget responsibility family. Both are equally important and require great attention.

Relevance of Women's Leadership in the Public Sphere

Based on the opinion of the three commentators above, they are pro scholars for women's leadership in the public sphere. However, from the opinion of the third mufassir it is better to present relevance to the leadership of women in Indonesia so that the three commentators can have a factual comparison thus strengthening the status of a woman whether worthy or not a public and domestic leader.

In Indonesia there are still many who debate the pros and cons of leadership women in the public sphere especially among Muslims. This is natural given the many differences of opinion between scholars and intellectuals discuss about women's leadership in the public sphere. However, lately along with the development of time, feminist figures adorn the realm of work, especially in political chair. This is the development of the progress of the Indonesian state, especially in regional people's leadership and the cabinet of ministers called the cabinet Indonesia is great, like Mrs. Risma who is the mayor of Surabaya whose performance truly praised for always caring for the poor and not discrediting the rich and various races. Then there is the former Khofifah Indar Parawansa mother Minister of Social Affairs, who was elected as the Governor of East Java which is always proven care about the social conditions of all Indonesian citizens. As well as a permanent figure survive with its achievements in the field of development and protection of the country's maritime affairs Indonesia is Mrs. Susi Pudjiastuti who has carried out internal bureaucratic reform the body of the Ministry of Maritime Affairs and Fisheries.

The figure of Mrs. Susi Pudjiastuti is a woman who can lead one the most important sector for the progress of the Indonesian

state, namely the Ministry of Maritime Affairs and Fishery. During his time leading the sector, many achievements have been achieved and recognized by the world even defeated the previous leadership. Although many among those who still doubt it because of their educational background which is only a junior high school graduate, but this does not become a stumbling block to achievement and to reap performance productive in managing the country's marine and fisheries resources. He making policies that strongly support the development of growth economy and marine and fisheries resources. Among the policies that have been made among them is a moratorium on foreign ship fishing permits in Indonesia, prohibition on using cantrang, prohibition of loading and unloading of fish catch in the middle the sea, a ban on catching lobsters and crabs that still lay eggs until the bombing foreign vessels that steal fish in Indonesian waters.

This is proof of a woman's leadership, they have never looked the difference between men and women in terms of leadership (public). Continue trying their best for the betterment of the Indonesian state that's what they did. Although there are still many debates and doubts about the leadership of women. But, at least the figure of Susi Pudjiastuti's mother and other great women in public leadership it has become evidence that women too can become good leaders and achievers.

The Relevance of Women's Leadership in the Domestic (Family) Domain

The smallest organization in society is a family, so far governed by marriage law, No. 1 of 1971. But the position women as "housewives" are stopped, tasked with "accompanying their husbands". This is in line with the interpretation of the archipelago mufassir which they argue that the highest leadership in the family is "male (husband)". Even if it's deep household, for example there is a stupid man (husband). Then leadership it remains with the men because something that rarely can not be used as legal proposition.

Indonesia is a country that gives the rights that it should owned by women, but not with family leadership because it has clear in the marriage law, No. 1 of 1971 that only women as a

housewife in charge of accompanying her husband. And this matter, according to the percentage of research conducted in the archipelago that most women be a leader in the family when a very problematic problem occurs fundamental. For example, a woman who was killed by her husband with leaving the child still young, so women must play a dual role the head of the family (husband) as well as being a housewife “so from the case The interpretation between the mufassir of the archipelago with the reality that occurs in Indonesia there is a synchronization signal.

The woman who has changed the function of the husband to become the head of the family, is wives with all the problems faced. The role is very complex, concerning the provision of a living, family security, family protection, education children, and so on.

To make women a good leader, women demanded to continue to gain knowledge regardless of age because women are responsible responsible for educating his child, the figure of his wife and also a mother is the first teacher for his children. It is from a mother that her child becomes the expected character become a generation that can be proud of by all groups, especially religion and country.

In this case, women are not the highest leaders in a family so that in this case women are more about “led” figures as they are interpretation of the archipelago mufassir relating to QS. An-Nisa ‘verse 34. That in the family the leader is “male” this is related to Asbab an-Nuzul that verse.

Conclusion

Imam Nawawi, Buya Hamka, and Quraish Shihab do not allow it women become leaders in the scope of the family (domestic). So in terms of this is the man (husband) who is the leader of the woman. This is based on the above various reasons and considerations. In this case, Imam Nawawi considers that men (husbands) become “leaders” of women in a house stairs because men have the power to educate their wives (Musallatuna ‘ala ta’ dibihinna) and because God gave an advantage to a man both in terms of physical, intellectual, etc. Unlike the case with Buya Hamka who said that men being a “leader” for women on the

grounds that men have advantages which God bestows in terms of physical, reason, and responsibility in giving earning and dowry. In addition, Hamka considers the reality of society.

This consideration is in line with the thoughts of M. Quraish Shihab who are considering about the reality that happens in society. On the other hand, M. Quraish Shihab has Another consideration is that from the psychic side that is owned by men, that is men more emotionally powerful than women in dealing with problems. So can be pulled together, that these three archipelago commentaries assume that “man (husband) is the leader over woman (wife)” in the household (domestic), by considering the advantages that God has given to men well in a manner reason, physical, psychic, and reality in Public. While, interpretation Mufassir Archipelago relating to public leadership tends to be loose. So women have the space to become public leaders. While the similarities in interpreting “Women’s leadership in space the domestic scope “of the three commentaries (Imam Nawawi, Hamka, and Quraish Shihab) placing men in a superior position while women in an inferior position. Thus, the holder of leadership in the household (domestic) is male (husband). While the difference in interpreting “leadership of the domestic realm of women” namely in terms of considerations and reasons as described above. Meanwhile, Equality in interpreting the verse “leadership of women in the public sphere” which is based on the story of Ratu Balqis namely from describing “leadership qualities Balqis is resounding in his leadership and that basic equation is “Women may be public leaders”. While the difference is that; Hamka allow women to become leaders by using the argument of the story the leadership of Ratu Balqis who was brilliant and a state expert. Unlike the case with Quraish Shihab, although allowing women to be public leaders, however do not allow the proposition of the story of the Queen of Saba ‘for the ability of women be a leader.

Bibliography

- Al-Jawī, Muhammad bin ‘Umar Nawawi. *Marāb Labīd*. 1st ed. Beirūt: Dār al-Kutub al-‘Alamiyah, n.d.
- Al-Wāhidī, ‘Alī Ibn Ahmad. *Asbāb Nuẓūl Al-Qur’ān*. Kairo: Dār al-

- Kitāb al-Jadīd, 1969.
- Doorn-Harder, Nelly van. "PURIFYING INDONESIA, PURIFYING WOMEN." *CrossCurrents* 69, no. 3 (January 29, 2019): 301–18. <https://doi.org/10.2307/26842580>.
- Fawaid, Ahmad. "Filologi Naskah Tafsīr Bi Al-Imlā' Surat Al-Baqarah Karya Kyai Zaini Mun'im." *Jurnal Studi Ilmu-Ilmu Al-Qur'an Dan Hadis* 20, no. 2 (2019): 143. <https://doi.org/10.14421/qh.2019.2002-02>.
- Fawaid, Ahmad, and Thoriqotul Faizah. "A Sociolinguistic Analysis of Sword Verses." *Al Quds Jurnal Studi Al-Qur'an Dan Hadis* 5 (2021): 119–40. <https://doi.org/10.29240/alquds.v5i1.2315>.
- Fawaid, Ahmad, and Nafi'ah Mardlatillah. "Bias Ideologis Tafsir Hizb Al-Tahrīr." *MAGHZA: Jurnal Ilmu Al-Qur'an Dan Tafsir* 5, no. 2 (2020): 184–209. <https://doi.org/10.24090/maghza.v5i2.4243>.
- Hamka. *Tafsir Al-Azhar*. 7th ed. Jakarta: Pustaka Panjimas, 1983.
- Mufidah, Ch. "Complexities in Dealing with Gender Inequality: Muslim Women and Mosque-Based Social Services in East Java Indonesia." *Journal of Indonesian Islam* 11, no. 2 (2017): 459–88. <https://doi.org/10.15642/JIIS.2017.11.2.459-488>.
- Mustaqim, Abdul. "The Epistemology of Javanese Qur'anic Exegesis: A Study of Sālih Darat's Fayd Al-Rahmān." *Al-Jami'ah* 55, no. 2 (2017): 357–90. <https://doi.org/10.14421/ajis.2017.552.357-390>.
- Rohmana, Jajang A. "Alquran Dan Bahasa Sunda Populer: Respons Generasi Milenial Terhadap Terjemahan Alquran Bahasa Sunda." *Al-Bayan: Jurnal Studi Ilmu Al-Qur'an Dan Tafsir* 4, no. 2 (2020): 93–110. <https://doi.org/10.15575/al-bayan.v4i2.8008>.
- Roifa, Rifa, Rosihon Anwar, and Dadang Darmawan. "Perkembangan Tafsir Di Indonesia (Pra Kemerdekaan 1900-1945)." *Al-Bayan: Jurnal Studi Ilmu Al-Qur'an Dan Tafsir* 2, no. 1 (2017): 21–36.
- Rokhmad, Abu, and Sulistiyono Susilo. "Conceptualizing Authority of the Legalization of Indonesian Women's Rights in Islamic Family Law." *Journal of Indonesian Islam* 11, no. 2 (2017): 489–508.

- <https://doi.org/10.15642/JIIS.2017.11.2.489-508>.
- Said, Hasani Ahmad. "Mengenal Tafsir Nusantara: Melacak Mata Rantai Tafsir Dari Indonesia, Malaysia, Thailand, Singapura Hingga Brunei Darussalam." *Refleksi*, 2018. <https://doi.org/10.15408/ref.v16i2.10193>.
- Sarwono, Billy K. "Gender Bias in a Patriarchal Society A Media Analysis on Virginity and Reproductive Health." *Wacana, Journal of the Humanities of Indonesia* 14, no. 1 (2012): 37. <https://doi.org/10.17510/wjhi.v14i1.48>.
- Shihab, M Quraish. *Tafsir Al-Misbah. Jakarta: Lentera Hati*. Vol. 2. Jakarta: Lentera Hati, 2002.
- Shihab, Muhammad Quraish. *Perempuan*. Tangerang: Lentera Hati, 2012.
- Subhan, Zaitunah. *Al-Quran Dan Perempuan*. Jakarta: PRENADAMEDIA GROUP, 2015.
- . "Tafsir Kebencian." *Studi Bias Gender Dalam Al-Qur'an, LKiS*, 1999.